

BUFFALO INTELLECTUAL  
PROPERTY  
LAW JOURNAL

Volume XI  
2015

Buffalo, New York  
Copyright 2015  
Buffalo Intellectual Property Law Journal

**SUNY Buffalo Law School**

**SUNY Buffalo Law School**  
**THE STATE UNIVERSITY OF NEW YORK**

Nancy L. Zimpher, B.A., M.A., Ph.D.  
*Chancellor of the State University of New York*

Satish Tripathi, B.Sc., M.Sc., M.S., M.S., Ph.D., D.Sc.  
*President of the State University of New York at Buffalo*

Charles F. Zukoski B.A., Ph.D.  
*Provost and Executive Vice President for Academic Affairs*

*Administration*

James A. Gardner, B.A., J.D.	<i>Interim Dean</i>
Elizabeth Adelman, B.A., M.L.S., J.D.	<i>Director of the Law Library and Vice Dean for Legal Information Service</i>
Guyora Binder, A.B., J.D.	<i>Vice Dean for Research and Faculty Development</i>
Luis Chiesa, B.B.A., J.D., LL.M., J.S.D.	<i>Vice Dean for Academic Affairs</i>
Kim Diana Connolly, B.A., J.D., LL.M.	<i>Vice Dean for Legal Skills and Director of Clinical Legal Education</i>
Marlene M. Cook, B.S., M.S., Ph.D.	<i>Vice Dean for Resource Management</i>
Ilene R. Fleischmann, B.A., M.A.	<i>Vice Dean for Alumni, Public Relations and Communications</i>
Karen R. Kaczmarek, B.A., J.D.	<i>Associate Dean for Development</i>
BobbyJo LaDelfa, B.S., M.S., Ph.D.	<i>Vice Dean for Strategic Planning and Operations</i>
Meredith Lewis, B.A. M.S., J.D.	<i>Vice Dean for International and Graduate Programs</i>
Terrance E. McCormack, B.A., M.L.S.	<i>Associate Director of the Law Library and Manager for Law School Technology</i>
Errol E. Meidinger, B.A., M.A., J.D., Ph.D.	<i>Director of Baldy Center for Law and Social Policy</i>
Lisa M. Patterson, A.B., J.D.	<i>Associate Dean for Career Services</i>
Melinda R. Saran, B.A., M.P.H., J.D.	<i>Vice Dean for Student Affairs</i>
Lillie V. Wiley-Upshaw, B.A., M.A.	<i>Vice Dean for Admissions &amp; Student Life</i>
Sara Zeitler, B.S., M.S.	<i>Assistant Dean for Records, Registration &amp; Financial Aid</i>

*Faculty*

Samantha Barbas, B.A., J.D., Ph.D.	<i>Associate Professor</i>
Christine Bartholomew, B.A., J.D.	<i>Associate Professor</i>
Mark Bartholomew, B.A., J.D.	<i>Professor</i>
Anya Bernstein, B.A., J.D., Ph.D.	<i>Associate Professor</i>
Guyora Binder, A.B., J.D.	<i>SUNY Distinguished Professor</i>
Michael Boucai, B.A., J.D., M.Phil	<i>Associate Professor</i>
Irus Braverman, LL.B., M.A., S.J.D.	<i>Professor</i>
Lauren Breen, A.B., J.D.	<i>Clinical Assistant Professor</i>
S. Todd Brown, B.A., J.D.	<i>Professor</i>
Luis Chiesa, B.B.A., J.D., LL.M., J.S.D.	<i>Professor</i>
Kim Diana Connolly, B.A., J.D., LL.M.	<i>Professor</i>
Matthew D. Dimick, B.A., M.S. J.D. Ph.D.	<i>Associate Professor</i>
David M. Engel, A.B., M.A., J.D.	<i>SUNY Distinguished Service Professor</i>

Charles P. Ewing, B.A., J.D., Ph.D.	<i>SUNY Distinguished Service Professor</i>
Lucinda M. Finley, B.A., J.D.	<i>Frank G. Raichle Professor of Trial and Appellate Advocacy</i>
Heidi Forman, B.S., M.A., J.D., LL.M.	<i>Teaching Faculty</i>
Rebecca R. French, B.A., J.D., LL.M., Ph.D.	<i>Professor</i>
James A. Gardner, B.A., J.D.	<i>SUNY Distinguished Professor, Bridget and Thomas Black</i>
Bernadette Gargano, B.A., M.A., J.D.	<i>Professor</i>
Lise Gelernter, A.B., J.D.	<i>Lecturer in Law</i>
Michael Halberstam, B.A., J.D., Ph.D.	<i>Teaching Faculty</i>
Philip Halpern, B.A., J.D.	<i>Associate Professor</i>
Nan L. Haynes, B.A., J.D.	<i>Professor</i>
George Kannar, B.A., J.D.	<i>Lecturer in Law</i>
Stuart G. Lazar, A.B., J.D., LL.M.	<i>Professor</i>
Meredith Lewis, B.A. M.S., J.D.	<i>Professor</i>
Patrick Long, A.B., J.D.	<i>Lecturer in Law</i>
Anjana Malhotra, B.A., J.D.	<i>Associate Professor</i>
Susan V. Mangold, A.B., J.D.	<i>Professor</i>
Isabel S. Marcus, B.A., M.A., J.D., Ph.D.	<i>Professor</i>
Martha T. McCluskey, B.A., J.D., J.S.D.	<i>Professor, William J. Magavern Faculty Scholar</i>
Errol E. Meidinger, B.A., M.A., J.D., Ph.D.	<i>Margaret W. Wong Professor</i>
Tara J. Melish, B.A., J.D.	<i>Associate Professor</i>
Teresa A. Miller, B.A., J.D., LL.M.	<i>Professor</i>
James G. Milles, B.A., M.A., M.L.I.S., J.D.	<i>Professor</i>
Christopher Moellering, A.B., M.Sc., J.D.	<i>Visiting Clinical Assistant Professor of Law</i>
Athena D. Mutua, B.A., J.D., M.A., LL.M.	<i>Professor, Floyd H. and Hilda L. Hurst Faculty Scholar</i>
Makau W. Mutua, LL.B., LL.M., LL.M., S.J.D.	<i>SUNY Distinguished Professor, Floyd H. and Hilda L. Hurst</i>
Johanna Oreskovic, B.A., M.A., Ed.M., J.D.	<i>Faculty Scholar</i>
Anthony O'Rourke, B.A., J.D.	<i>Lecturer in Law</i>
Jessica Owley, B.A., M.L.A., M.S., J.D., Ph.D.	<i>Associate Professor</i>
Stephen Paskey, B.A., J.D.	<i>Associate Professor</i>
Danielle Pelfrey Duryea, B.A., M.A., J.D.	<i>Lecturer in Law</i>
Stephanie L. Phillips, B.S., J.D.	<i>Visiting Clinical Assistant Professor of Law</i>
Laura B. Reilly, B.A., J.D.	<i>Professor</i>
Melinda R. Saran, B.A., M.P.H., J.D.	<i>Lecturer in Law</i>
John Henry Schlegel, B.A., J.D.	<i>Teaching Faculty</i>
Barbara A. Sherk, B.S., M.S., J.D.	<i>Professor, Floyd H. and Hilda L. Hurst Faculty Scholar</i>
Matthew Steilen, B.A., J.D., Ph.D.	<i>Teaching Faculty</i>
Robert J. Steinfeld, B.A., A.M., J.D., LL.M., Ph.D.	<i>Associate Professor</i>
Rick Su, B.A., J.D.	<i>Joseph W. Belluck and Laura L. Aswad Professor of Civil Justice</i>
Mateo Taussig-Rubbo, B.A., M.Phil., J.D., Ph.D.	<i>Professor</i>
Monica Wallace, B.A., J.D.	<i>Professor</i>
David A. Westbrook, B.A., J.D.	<i>Lecturer in Law</i>
James A. Wooten, B.A., M.A., M.Phil., J.D., Ph.D.	<i>Louis A. DelCotto Professor</i>
	<i>Professor</i>

*Faculty Emeriti*

James B. Atleson, B.A., J.D., LL.M.	<i>SUNY Distinguished Teaching Professor Emeritus</i>
Dianne Avery, B.A., M.A.T., J.D.	<i>Professor Emerita</i>
Robert S. Berger, A.B., J.D.	<i>Professor Emeritus</i>
Barry B. Boyer, B.A., J.D.	<i>Professor Emeritus</i>
Thomas E. Headrick, B.A., B.Litt., LL.B., Ph.D.	<i>SUNY Distinguished Service Professor Emeritus</i>
George M. Hezel, A.B., M.A., J.D.	<i>Clinical Professor Emeritus</i>
Kenneth F. Joyce, B.A., LL.B., LL.M.	<i>SUNY Distinguished Teaching Professor Emeritus</i>
Alfred S. Konefsky, B.A., J.D.	<i>University at Buffalo Distinguished Professor Emeritus</i>
Janet S. Lindgren, B.A., J.D.	<i>Professor Emerita</i>
Lynn M. Mather, B.A., Ph.D.	<i>SUNY Distinguished Service Professor Emerita</i>
Elizabeth B. Mensch, B.A., M.A.T., J.D., LL.M.	<i>SUNY Distinguished Teaching Professor Emerita</i>
R. Nils Olsen, B.A., J.D.	<i>Professor Emeritus</i>
Robert I. Reis, B.A., J.D., LL.M.	<i>Professor Emeritus</i>
Anthony H. Szczygiel, B.A., J.D.	<i>Professor Emeritus</i>
Judy Scales-Trent, B.A., M.A., J.D.	<i>Professor Emerita</i>
Suzanne E. Tomkins, B.A., J.D.	<i>Clinical Professor Emerita</i>

For information regarding subscriptions, copyright, permission to reprint, permission to photocopy, advertising, or submission, please contact the *Buffalo Intellectual Property Law Journal* at [Info@buffaloipjournal.org](mailto:Info@buffaloipjournal.org), or by mail at State University of New York Buffalo Law School, Buffalo Intellectual Property Law Journal, 404 John Lord O'Brian Hall, North Campus, Box 60110, Buffalo, New York 14260-1100. The *Buffalo Intellectual Property Law Journal* is on the web at [buffaloipjournal.org](http://buffaloipjournal.org).

\*\*\*\*\*

The *Buffalo Intellectual Property Law Journal* is published annually at Joe Christensen, Inc., 1540 Adams Street, Lincoln, Nebraska 68521. Inquiries are also accepted by email at [BusinessEditor@buffaloipjournal.org](mailto:BusinessEditor@buffaloipjournal.org). Periodicals postage is paid at Lincoln, Nebraska and at additional mailing offices.

Current subscriptions for Volume 11 are: \$27.00 for domestic mailing; \$32.00 for international mailing. All requests for Volume 11 are to be made to the *Buffalo Intellectual Property Law Journal*. All remittances, payable in advance, are to be made in U.S. Currency and payable at a United States bank. Please enclose your check or money order made payable to the *Buffalo Intellectual Property Law Journal* with the order. For back volumes and subsequent single issues, microforms, and/or online service, contact William S. Hein & Co., Inc., 1285 Main Street, Buffalo, New York 14209, 1-800-828-7581. For prices of single issues and back volumes, microforms, and/or online service, please contact William S. Hein & Co.

Subscriptions are renewed automatically upon expiration unless the subscriber sends notice of termination at least 30 days prior to the renewal date. All notifications of change of address should include old and new addresses, including zip code and be directed to the Journal's office. Please notify at least 30 days in advance to ensure prompt delivery.

Domestic claims of non-receipt of issues should be made within 90 days of mailing date, international mailings within 180 days; otherwise, the regular back issue rate will be charged for replacement.

\*\*\*\*\*

The *Buffalo Intellectual Property Law Journal* welcomes manuscripts relevant to the discipline of intellectual property. Text should be typewritten, double spaced, with one-inch margins and consecutively numbered pages. Footnotes should be numbered consecutively. In preparing text and footnotes, authors should consult the style presented in *The Bluebook: A Uniform System of Citation* (The Harvard Law Review Association ed., 20th ed. 2015). Parallel citation to U.S.P.Q. should be included where applicable. For questions of literary style not included in the *Bluebook* authors should consult *The Chicago Manual of Style* (University of Chicago Press, 16th ed. 2010). All citations should be placed in the footnotes, even if the authority is mentioned in the text.

\*\*\*\*\*

All articles Copyright 2015 by the *Buffalo Intellectual Property Law Journal*, except when otherwise expressly indicated. Please address your written request to the Law Journal for permission to reprint an article or any portion thereof.

### *Disclaimer*

These materials have been prepared solely for educational and informational purposes to contribute to the understanding of United States intellectual property law. These materials reflect only the personal views of the authors and are not individualized legal advice. It is understood that each case is fact specific, and that the appropriate solution in any case will vary. Therefore, these materials may or may not be relevant to any particular situation. Thus, the authors and their respective universities, law firms, companies, and employers, cannot be bound either philosophically or as representatives of their various present and future clients to the comments expressed in these materials. The presentation of these materials does not establish any form of attorney-client relationship with these authors. While every attempt was made to ensure that these materials are accurate, errors or omissions may be contained therein, for which any liability is disclaimed.







# BUFFALO INTELLECTUAL PROPERTY LAW JOURNAL

---

---

VOLUME XI

2015

---

---

*Editor-in-Chief*

JOHN FRACZEK

*Executive Articles Editor*

ALINA HASAN

*Executive Articles Editor*

CATHERINE DOWNEY

*Executive Managing Editor*

LEE WILLIAMS

*Executive Submissions Editor*

ANDREW DEMASTERS

*Executive Technology Editor*

ERIK BURROWS

*Executive Publications Editor*

ASHLEY CZECHOWSKI

*Executive Business Editor*

MICHAEL PANTZER

*Associates*

PHILIP BARTH  
MARIA BITKA  
DANIEL CAROSA  
JOHN DARNELL  
DENNIS DAVIS  
JOHN DIMAIO  
KRISTEN DOMBROWSKI

ANDREA GERVAIS  
ANTHONY ILACQUA  
DANIELLE KELLY  
MICHAEL KELLY  
NICOLE KOUSMANIDIS  
MEGAN MCGUIGGAN  
ETHAN MURPHY  
MARINA MURRAY

MATTHEW PARIS  
JESSE PYLE  
ANDREW REMLEY  
KIERRA SHAH  
GREG SMITH  
AARON VANNOSTRAND  
LARRY WATERS



# BUFFALO INTELLECTUAL PROPERTY LAW JOURNAL

---

VOLUME XI

2015

---

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

### NOTE

**HERE TODAY, GONE TOMORROW? POST-GRANT REVIEW AND  
PTAB INTERPRETATION OF § 101 SUBJECT MATTER AFTER**

***MYRIAD***

*CONOR T. FLYNN*

1

### ARTICLES

**VERY FEW APPRECIATED JUST HOW BAD AIA *INTER PARTES*  
REVIEWS (IPRS) WOULD BE FOR PATENT OWNERS, ALTHOUGH  
IPR DENIALS HAVE BEEN, FOR PATENT OWNERS, A GLIMMER OF  
HOPE**

*STACY LEWIS*

28

*TOM IRVING*

**SPOTLIGHT ON CLAIM CONSTRUCTION BEFORE PTAB**

*JAMES STEIN*

73

*JENNIFER GUPTA*

*HOJUNG CHO*

*STACY LEWIS*

*TOM IRVING*

**SPOTLIGHT ON OBJECTIVE EVIDENCE OF NONOBVIOUSNESS IN**

**AIA POST-GRANT PROCEEDINGS**

*SHING-YI (CINDY) CHENG*

104

*LI FENG*

*STACY LEWIS*

*TOM IRVING*

**NAVIGATING THE LIMITATIONS ON DISCOVERY IN AIA POST-GRANT PROCEEDINGS**

*MARY R. HENNIGER*

135

*JILL K. MACALPINE*

*AMELIA FEULNER BAUR*

*ANTHONY A. HARTMANN*

*LARA C. KELLEY*

*REBECCA M. MCNEILL*

*P. ANDREW RILEY*

*MICHAEL A. STRAMIELLO*

**AMENDING RATHER THAN CANCELLING CLAIMS IN *INTER PARTES* REVIEWS**

*STACY LEWIS*

178

*TOM IRVING*

**STAY AWHILE: THE EVOLVING LAW OF DISTRICT COURT STAYS IN LIGHT OF *INTER PARTES* REVIEW, POST-GRANT REVIEW, AND COVERED BUSINESS METHOD POST-GRANT REVIEW**

*JONATHAN STROUD*

226

*LINDA THAYER*

*JEFFREY C. TOTTEN*

**ADJUSTING FOR THE NEW NORMAL: THOUGHTS ON ENHANCING THE POSSIBILITIES OF SUCCESS FOR THE PATENT OWNER IN AN AIA POST-GRANT PROCEEDING**

*AMANDA MURPHY*

258

*STACY LEWIS*

*DEBORAH HERZFELD*

*NINGLING WANG*

*WEN LI*

*TOM IRVING*